# UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

Docket No.: 1:18-cv-11336-FDS

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS ex rel. MYKEL POWELL, COMMONWEALTH SECOND AMENDMENT, INC. and BRENT CARLTON; and MYKEL POWELL,

Plaintiffs,

v.

BRIAN HOLMES, in his Individual and his Official Capacity as the Sergeant of the Stoughton Police Department; JAMES O'CONNOR, in his Individual and his Official Capacity as Deputy Chief of the Stoughton Police Department; DONNA M. McNAMARA, in her Individual and his Official Capacity as Chief of the Stoughton Police Department; VILLAGE GUN SHOP, INC. d/b/a VILLAGE VAULT; and PETER DOWD.

**Defendants** 

# <u>DEFENDANTS BRIAN HOLMES, JAMES O'CONNOR AND DONNA M.</u> McNAMARA'S ANSWER TO <u>PLAINTIFFS' THIRD AMENDED COMPLAINT</u>

Brian Holmes, James O'Connor and Donna M. McNamara ("Defendants") hereby respond to the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

- 1. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it is introductory only and contains conclusions of law.
- 2. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it is introductory only and contains conclusions of law.
- 3. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it is introductory only and contains conclusions of law.

# **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 4. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 5. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 6. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 7. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.

#### **PARTIES**

- 8. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 9. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 10. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 11. The Defendants admit that Brian Holmes is a member of the Stoughton Police

  Department. The Defendants deny the remaining allegations contained in this

  paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

- 12. The Defendants admit that James O'Connor is a member of the Stoughton Police

  Department. The Defendants deny the remaining allegations contained in this

  paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 13. The Defendants admit the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs'
  Third Amended Complaint.
- 14. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 15. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 16. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 17. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 18. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

- 19. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 20. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 21. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 22. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 23. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 24. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the

- truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 25. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 26. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 27. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 28. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 29. This defendant has been dismissed. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# STATUTORY PROVISIONS GOVERNING THE SEIZURE, STORAGE AND SALE OF FIREARMS

- 30. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 31. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 32. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 33. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 34. This paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.

# THE SEIZURE OF PLAINTIFF MYKEL POWELL'S PROPERTY

- 35. The Defendants admit the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs'
  Third Amended Complaint.
- 36. The Defendants admit the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs'
  Third Amended Complaint.
- 37. (a.-d.) The Defendants admit that the Stoughton Police Department suspended the Plaintiff's LTC in light of his arrest and pending charges, Sergeant Holmes went to the Plaintiff's home, provided a letter advising of the suspension, and took custody of the Plaintiff's (a) Smith and Wesson SD9 VE 9 MM pistol, Serial: HFN6346; (b) Bushmaster Rifle, model XM15-ES2, Serial: BFI643914; (c) empty magazines; and (d) bag.

- 38. The Defendants admit the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 39. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 40. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 41. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 42. The Defendants admit that Defendant Holmes referred the Plaintiff to Defendant O'Connor. The Defendants deny that Defendant O'Connor is the Deputy Chief.
- 43. The Defendants admit that Defendant O'Connor told the Plaintiff that the firearms had been disposed. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the remaining allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 44. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 45. The Defendants state that no response is required to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint because the referenced document speaks for itself.

# **VILLAGE VAULT'S "CREDIT" AGREEMENT**

- 46. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 47. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 48. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 49. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# **VILLAGE VAULT'S ACTIONS HERE**

#### Stoughton Police Department

- 50. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 51. The Defendants admit that a credit issued for the stated amount. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the remaining allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 52. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 53. The Defendants admit that a credit issued for the stated amount. Answering further, the Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient

- to form a belief as to the truth of the remaining allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 54. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 55. The Defendants state that no response is required to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint because the referenced document and exhibit speaks for itself.
- 56. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 57. The Defendants admit that the rifle was returned to the Plaintiff.
- 58. The Defendants deny the allegations as contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Springfield Police Department

- 59. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 60. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 61. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

62. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Plymouth Police Department

- 63. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 64. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 65. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 66. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Winchester Police Department

- 67. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 68. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

- 69. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 70. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Chicopee Police Department

- 71. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 72. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 73. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# <u>Dedham Police Department</u>

- 74. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 75. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

76. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Medford Police Department

- 77. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 78. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

#### Reading Police Department

- 79. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 80. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Wakefield Police Department

81. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

- 82. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 83. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 84. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 85. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 86. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 87. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 88. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Wilmington Police Department

- 89. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 90. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 91. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 92. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 93. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Andover Police Department

- 94. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 95. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

- 96. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 97. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 98. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Foxborough Police Department

- 99. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 100. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 101. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Gardner Police Department

102. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

103. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# **Hudson Police Department**

- 104. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 105. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 106. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 107. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 108. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 109. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# Saugus Police Department

- 110. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 111. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.
- 112. The Defendants are without personal knowledge or information sufficient to form a belief as to the truth of the allegations contained in this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint.

# COUNT I 42 U.S.C. §1983

# Mykel Powell-v.- Sergeant Holmes, Deputy Chief [sic] O'Connor & Chief McNamara

- 113. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 114. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 115. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 116. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 117. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.

- 118. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 119. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 120. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.

#### **COUNT II**

# False Claims Act, M.G.L. c. 12, §§ 5A-50

Commonwealth of Massachusetts ex rel. Mykel Powell, Commonwealth Second Amendment & Brent Carlton –v.– Deputy Chief O'Connor, Chief McNamara, Village Vault, City of Springfield, Town of Plymouth, Town of Winchester, City of Chicopee, Town of Dedham, City of Medford, Town of Reading, Town of Wakefield, Town of Wilmington, Town of Andover, Town of Foxborough, City of Gardner, Town of Hudson & Town of Saugus

- 121. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 122. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 123. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 124. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 125. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.
- 126. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law.

# **COUNT III**

# **Civil Conspiracy**

Commonwealth of Massachusetts ex rel. Mykel Powell, Commonwealth Second Amendment & Brent Carlton –v.– Deputy Chief O'Connor, Chief McNamara & Village Vault

- 127. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law and the count has been dismissed.
- 128. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law and the count has been dismissed.
- 129. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law and the count has been dismissed.
- 130. (a.-c.) This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law and the count has been dismissed.
- 131. This paragraph of the Plaintiff's Third Amended Complaint does not require a response as it contains conclusions of law and the count has been dismissed.

# **COUNT IV**

# Civil Conspiracy Mykel Powell-v.-Peter Dowd

- 132. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 133. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 134. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 135. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.

- 136. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended

  Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 137. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended

  Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 138. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 139. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 140. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 141. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 142. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended

  Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 143. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 144. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 145. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 146. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.

- 147. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended

  Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them. The

  Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended

  Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 148. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 149. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 150. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 151. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 152. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 153. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 154. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 155. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 156. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.

- 157. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 158. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 159. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 160. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 161. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 162. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 163. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 164. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 165. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 166. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 167. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.

- 168. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 169. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 170. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 171. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 172. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 173. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 174. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.
- 175. The Defendants do not respond to this paragraph of the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint as the count and paragraph are not directed toward them.

WHEREFORE, the Defendants deny that the Plaintiffs are entitled to any relief or judgment in the Plaintiffs' favor, including: (1) compensatory damages; (2) punitive damages; (3) interest, costs and/or attorneys' fees and costs; (4) monetary damages; (5) declaratory judgment; (6) civil penalties and/or any award of treble damages; (7) injunctive relief; or (8) any other type of relief. Rather, the Defendants state that they are each entitled to judgment in their favor against the Plaintiffs. The Defendants therefore request that this Honorable Court dismiss

the Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint, with prejudice, and award interest, costs and attorneys' fees for the Defendants and against the Plaintiffs.

# **AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES**

# **First Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs' Third Amended Complaint fails to state a cause of action or claim for which relief can be granted.

# **Second Affirmative Defense**

The Defendants are entitled to qualified immunity and absolute immunity.

# **Third Affirmative Defense**

The Defendants were privileged in conduct and acts, and, therefore, the Plaintiffs cannot recover.

# **Fourth Affirmative Defense**

The Defendants were justified in all acts and/or conduct, and, therefore, the Plaintiffs cannot recover.

# Fifth Affirmative Defense

The Defendants' acts and conduct were performed according to and protected by law and/or legal process, and, therefore, the Plaintiffs cannot recover.

# **Sixth Affirmative Defense**

The Defendants cannot be held liable for punitive damages, attorneys' fees, interest and/or costs.

# **Seventh Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because of the provisions of M.G.L. c. 258.

# **Eighth Affirmative Defense**

Any alleged damages were caused by the Plaintiffs' own conduct or by person(s) or an entity over which the Defendants have no responsibility or control.

# **Ninth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiff's arrest and apprehension and any damages were caused by the Plaintiff's own conduct and acts.

# **Tenth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because they lack standing.

# **Eleventh Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because of the provisions of M.G.L. c. 140.

# **Twelfth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because of the provisions of M.G.L. c. 12.

# **Thirteenth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because they are not proper relators under the False Claims Act.

# **Fourteenth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because they have not suffered any damages.

# **Fifteenth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs' claims are barred by the statute of limitations.

# **Sixteenth Affirmative Defense**

The Plaintiffs cannot recover because at all times the Defendants were acting in good faith.

# **Seventeenth Affirmative Defense**

As government employees, the Defendants are protected by Massachusetts common law good faith immunity and are therefore are shielded from liability from the Plaintiffs' state claims.

# **JURY CLAIM**

THE DEFENDANTS CLAIM A TRIAL BY JURY ON ALL COUNTS SO TRIABLE.

Respectfully submitted,
The Defendants,
Brian Holmes, James O'Connor, and Donna A. McNamara,
By their attorneys,

# /s/ Thomas R. Donohue

Thomas R. Donohue, BBO# 643483 Erica L. Brody, BBO# 681572 BRODY, HARDOON, PERKINS & KESTEN, LLP 699 Boylston Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor Boston, MA 02116 (617) 880-7100 tdonohue@bhpklaw.com ebrody@bhpklaw.com

DATED: July 9, 2021

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that this document was filed through the ECF system and will therefore be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electric Filing (NEF) and paper copies will be sent this day to those participants indicated as non-registered participants.

/s/ Thomas R. Donohue

Thomas R. Donohue, BBO# 643483

DATED: July 9, 2021